THE SOURCE OF ERRORS IN INDONESIAN-ENGLISH TRANSLATION

Silvia Utami
Sekolah Tinggi Bahasa Asing Persada Bunda Pekanbaru
csilviany@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
This research aimed to identify types of translation errors and to find out the sources of errors (interlingual and intralingual errors) in Indonesian-English translation written by the fourth semester of English department students at UIN Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau Pekanbaru in the academic year 2015/2016. The samples were 40 students who have been taken by using proportional random sampling. The data were collected through translation test that consisted of 20 Indonesian sentences that should be translated into English. The type of this research was descriptive research which used Error Analysis procedures to identify and analyze the students’ error. The findings showed that the types of grammatical errors made by the students in their translation were three types, namely global errors, local errors, and other errors. The most frequent error made by the students was local errors and the fewest error made by the students was other errors. Then, this research revealed that mostly errors occurred in students’ translation were caused by intralingual error. Meanwhile, only few errors were caused by interlingual error. The errors occurred due students’ incomplete knowledge of the target language.

Keywords: grammatical error; interlingual; intralingual; translation.

INTRODUCTION
Translation is one of the major courses that should be taken by university students. They are trained to translate a text from Indonesian into English or vice versa. The most important point in doing translation is that the students are not allowed to translate the text literally from the source language to the target language since the translation is rendering the meaning of a text into another language in the way that the author intended the text (Newmark, 1988). Thus, the students should focus on the meaning of a text in translating which have similarity and equivalence in the both original text and the target ones.

Translation is a challenging work for students since the intended meaning of the source language should be considered before translating it into target language. Currently, many students tend to use literal translation in doing translation tasks. They transfer the sentence pattern from Indonesian into English that consequently causes many errors occurred in the result of their translations (Retnomurti and Imran, 2013). These errors can be caused by several factors, such as the interference from students’ mother tongue (L1) or lack of knowledge of English grammar (L2) (Hambali, 2011; Shan-ling and Yan, 2013). Students’ mother tongue takes an important role in the second language acquisition since they use their previous knowledge when facing problem in acquiring a new language. Then, the students’ competence of the target language cannot be denied, because if they do not have sufficient knowledge about the target language they will make errors. Hence, the students face some difficulties in doing translation task that causes problems, especially in the Indonesian-English translation.

Regarding the preliminary observation and interview at the second year English department students of UIN Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau Pekanbaru, some problems were encountered by the students in doing Indonesian-English translation task. First, some students tend to transfer the sentence pattern from Indonesian into English when translating the text. Second, some students tend to simplify and generalize the structure of the target language.
Third, some students order the word wrongly when translating a sentence from Indonesian into English. It happens because the students use the Indonesian structure in translating English sentence. Although it is accepted in Indonesian structure, but when translating the source text into target text (English), the students should pay attention to the structure of the target text itself since it will cause the wrong information or meaning. It is supported by Baker (2011) who says that word order is extremely important in translation because it plays a major role in maintaining a coherent point of view and in orientating messages at text level.

Based on the problems depicted above, it shows that the major problem was that the students make some errors in doing Indonesian-English translation. This study aimed to identify and analyze the types of grammatical errors and the sources of errors in their translation. The grammatical errors made by the students were divided into three: global errors or errors violate the overall structure of a sentence and for this reason may make it difficult to process, local errors or errors that affect only a single constituent in the sentence and are less likely to create any processing problems, and other errors or errors that cannot be categorized as global and local errors. These types were proposed by Lane and Lange (1999). Then, the sources of errors were categorized into two: interlingual error as the result of L1 transfer and intralingual errors as the result of insufficient knowledge of the target language.

Error Analysis in Translation

Error analysis is concerned with the analysis of the errors committed by L2 learners by comparing the learners’ acquired norms with the target language norms and explaining the identified errors. According to Crystal (2008), Error analysis in language learning is a technique for identifying, classifying and systematically interpreting the unacceptable forms produced by learner learning a foreign language, using any of the principles and procedures provided by linguistics. Then, Ellis and Barkhuizen (2005) described that Error analysis as a set of procedures for identifying, describing and explaining learners’ errors which are not only about identifying and detecting errors, but also it is actually trying to explain why they are made. Thus, the study of errors is part of the investigation of the process of language learning. In this respect, it resembles methodologically the study of the acquisition of the mother tongue. It provides the teacher with a picture of the linguistic development of a learner and may give him/ her indications as to the learning process (Corder, 1974). Therefore, error analysis is the study of the errors committed by the learner in learning language which using any principles and procedures.

Before conducting Error Analysis in translation, the concept of translation itself should be considered. According to Catford (1965), translation is the replacement of textual material in one language (source) by equivalent textual material in another language (target). Similarly, Bell (1998) stated that translation is the replacement of representation of a text in one language by a representation of an equivalence text in a second language. Then, Bassnett (2002) concluded two main concerns in defining translation. He stated that translation involves the rendering of a source language (SL) text into the target language (TL) so as to ensure that (1) the surface meaning of the two will be approximately similar and (2) the structures of the SL will be preserved as closely as possible but not so closely that the TL structures will be seriously distorted. Therefore, translation is not only to replace the language of a text from one language into another language but also have to consider the meaning and the structures of the SL that equivalent to TL.

In doing the translation, the students should take into account the equivalence of word, grammar, text and pragmatic of the source language to the target language. Baker (2011) differentiated four levels the notion of equivalence, in relation to the translation, including all different aspect of translation and hence putting together the linguistic and the communicative approach. They are word level equivalence (the equivalence of SL word and TL word),
grammatical equivalence (the equivalence of grammatical structures of SL and TL), textual equivalence (the equivalence between a SL text and a TL text in terms of information and cohesion), and pragmatic equivalence (the equivalence between a SL text and a TL text in terms of coherence and process of interpretation). Regarding this study, the students face difficulties to find out the equivalence of the grammatical structure of Indonesian and English because Indonesian has a different structure that can not be found in English. Consequently, the wrong information will be obtained due to the incorrect grammatical structure as stated by Baker (2011). She said that differences in the grammatical structures of the source and target languages often result in some change in the information content of the message during the process of translation. This change may take the form of adding to the target text information which is not expressed in the source text.

Types of Grammatical Errors in Translation

Errors are an inevitable and indeed necessary part of the learning process. Students can make some errors before acquiring the second language. In translation, errors are also an unavoidable part of the students when doing translation from the Source Text (ST) to the Target Text (TT). Grammatical errors occur when the sentence has an ungrammatical structure that causes errors. Oshima and Hogue (1999) stated that grammatical errors may happen if one omits the rules of language. The rules are necessary to make correct sentences. If someone does not follow the rule and makes an incorrect sentence, grammatical errors may happen. Leacock, et al (2010) notes that grammars contain specific rules about the syntax and morphology of a language. For example, a prepositional phrase can follow an intransitive verb but a noun phrase cannot. This rule has been set and cannot be rejected. As a result, the grammatical error can occur when making a sentence.

Dulay, Burt, and Krashen (1982) categorized error into two types, global and local errors. Global errors refer to errors that affect overall sentence organization significantly hinder communication. While errors that affect single element (constituents) in a sentence do not usually hinder communication significantly is called local errors. Similarly, Ellis (1997) explains that global errors mean some errors violate the overall structure of a sentence and for this reason may make it difficult to process. Local errors refer to errors that affect only a single constituent in the sentence and are less likely to create any processing problems. Furthermore, Lane and Lange (1999) classified the errors in the grammatical structure into three parts, they are global errors, local errors, and other errors. These types of errors can be seen as follow:

Global Errors (More serious)

a. Incorrect verb tense (an error in the choice of verb tense and aspects in a sentence), e.g. I was in the United States since 1985
b. Verb incorrectly formed (an error in the formation of the main verb, i.e. base form, infinitive form and gerund form, or any part of a verb phrase), e.g. we have not yet estimate the cost of the trip
c. Incorrect use or formation of a modal (an error that involves the wrong choice of a modal, the wrong form of any part of a modal verb phrase, or the wrong time reference of a modal verb phrase), e.g. she do not come to the class yesterday
d. Incorrect use or formation of a dependent clause (an error which the formulation of a relative, adverbial, or noun clause is incorrect), e.g. the people whom I have met them in my class are very friendly
e. Incorrect sentence structure (an error in which part of the grammatical structure of a sentence is incorrect), e.g. Is an interesting class in which I am learning a great deal
f. Incorrect or awkward word order (an error in which the order of words in a sentence is incorrect or awkward), e.g. Mary yesterday went to the library
g. Incorrect or missing connecting word (an error in which the connection between words, clauses and sentences is either unclear or illogical because of a missing, incorrect, or misplaced connecting word or phrase) *e.g. I did not study, I got an A on the test*

**Local Errors (Less serious)**

a. Incorrect subject-verb agreement (an error in which a verb does not show agreement in number -singular or plural- with its subject), *e.g. every person should try to choose a place to live that suit his or her needs.*

b. Incorrect or missing article (an error in which the article has been used incorrectly), *e.g. All of Ø textbooks for this class have been sold*

c. Problem with the singular or plural of a noun (an error in which the singular form of a noun has been used instead of the plural or vice versa), *e.g. he gave me some informations*

d. Incorrect word choice (an error in which the wrong word has been used in a sentence), *e.g. the essay we just read is an exception from a longer work (instead of except)*

e. Incorrect word form (an error in which the incorrect part of speech has been used), *e.g. I studied hardly before I took the TOEFL exam*

f. Incorrect use of preposition (an error occurs when a preposition has been incorrectly used), *e.g. he just hung off the phone*

**Other Errors (cannot be categorized as global and local errors)**

a. Fragment (an error when one or more of the three elements required making a sentence -a subject, a predicate, and a grammatically complete thought- was missing), *e.g. three people standing in the corner.*

b. Unclear (an error when the message that the students wanted to convey was unclear and the sentence was grammatically incorrect), *e.g. I can experienced the truth of studying by a coffee.*

**Interlingual Error**

In translating the sentence, the students commit such errors that caused by two factors. One of the factors is the result of language transfer (Richards and Schmidt, 2010). An error which occurs due to negative transfer from mother tongue or native language also called as interference. The term “interference” has been used to refer to two very distinct linguistic phenomena, one that is essentially psychological and another that is essentially sociolinguistics. The psychological use of the term interference refers to the influence of old habits when new ones are being learned, whereas the sociolinguistic use of interference refers to language interactions such as linguistic borrowing and language switching that occur when two language communities are in contact (Dulay, 1982). However, Richards and Schmidt (2010) noted that interference is the use of a native-language pattern or rule which leads to an error or inappropriate form in the target language. Therefore, it can be stated that interlingual error or interference is the result of language transfer from native-language pattern to target language which can cause some errors.

In distinguishing the grammatical interference in students’ translation, Weinreich (1968) noticed some types of grammatical relation are as follows:

1. **Order errors.** The students wrongly order the word in a sentence as the result of word-by-word translation from their first language. This error will cause the sentence becomes unstructured because it was ordered based on students’ first language pattern.

2. **Agreement and dependence.** The students made an error in the agreement and dependence in the sentences. The verb or noun in the sentence did not show agreement in number with the subject and the noun itself.
It can be said that interference or interlingual error could inhibit students in acquiring the second language and cause them committed some errors in acquiring the target language. In this study, the interlingual error in students’ translation will be analyzed since some previous studies found that interlingual error is one of the sources of errors in learning the second language.

**Intralingual Error**

In Error Analysis, while interference from L1 is acknowledged as a source of errors, it is by no means considered to be the only source for making errors. In fact, one of the major contributions of Error Analysis was its recognition of the sources of errors, which extend beyond just interlingual errors in learning a second language (Keshavarz, 2012). Intralingual errors occur when the students making overgeneralization of particular rules in the target language. It happens because the students’ English knowledge is limited, when they try to generalize some language rules too much or too little, they are usually affected by intralingual transfer and make errors (Shan-ling, 2012). Thus, intralingual errors happen when the students are ignorant of a second language item and making a generalization on its items.

In this research, the intralingual error was classified by using some features proposed by Richards (1974) and Keshavarz (2012), they are:

a. *Over-generalization.* This type of error covers instances where the student creates a deviant structure on the basis of his experience of other structures in the target language. For example, *he is walks quickly.* In this case, the student generalizes the present progressive form by adding to be before the verb without changing the verb form into *-ing*.

b. *Ignorance of rule restriction.* This type of error is due to the student’s ignorance of the restrictions and exceptions to general target language rules. The student applies the rules to the context where they do not apply. For example, *There were many fishes in the lake.* In this case, the student uses their previous acquired rule in a new situation by adding *–s* for every plural noun either it is a countable or an uncountable noun.

c. *False concepts hypothesized.* This type of error can be considered as sorts of generalizations which are due to the learner’s limited knowledge of the target language. The students used the certain elements in inappropriate contexts through analogy. In other words, they have mastered certain elements of the target language may attempt to use those elements in contexts where they are inappropriate. For example, *he went into his father in the street, but could not say anything.* In this case, the student is familiar with the use of preposition *into* in the expression “run into somebody” meaning “meet somebody accidentally” and hence by false analogy he misused it with another verb (i.e. go) yielding an erroneous sentence.

d. *Incomplete application or rules.* This type error occurs when the student fails to learn the more complex types of structure because he finds that he can achieve communication by using relatively simple rules. For example: *how you say it in English?* In this case, the student uses statement form in the question. He omits the auxiliary *do* where it is necessarily placed before the subject.

**METHODOLOGY OF THE RESEARCH**

The type of this study was a descriptive study which used Error Analysis procedures to identify and analyze the students’ error. The population of this research was the second year English department students at UIN Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau Pekanbaru in the academic year 2015/2016. They were 261 students who enrolled the translation class. The samples were 40 students who have been taken by using proportional random sampling. The data were collected
through translation test that consisted of 20 Indonesian sentences that should be translated into English. The test has been validated by expert judgment.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Based on the data obtained, there were three types of grammatical errors made by the students in their translations; they were global errors, local errors, and other errors. The most frequent errors made by the students was local errors with 1435 of the total number of errors (62.58). The errors were divided into six parts with the highest error occurrences in students’ translation was incorrect word choice with 327 of the total number of errors (22.79%) and followed by an incorrect or missing article with 301 of the total number of errors (21.39%). Then, the fewest error occurrences in students’ translation were incorrect subject-verb agreement with 106 of the total number of errors (7.39%) and followed by incorrect use of singular/plural with 144 of the total number of errors (10.03%). Furthermore, the second most of types of error made by the students in their translation were global errors with 766 of the total number of errors (33.41%). The errors were classified into seven parts with the total occurrences of each part was incorrect verb form with 353 of the total number of errors (41.78%) and followed by incorrect verb tense with 152 of the total number of errors (17.99%). Then, the fewest errors made by the students was the incorrect use of modal and incorrect use of a connector with 14 of the total number of errors (1.66%). Last, the fewest types of errors made by the students was other errors with 92 of the total number of errors (4.01) which divided into two parts with unclear sentences was the most frequent errors made by the students with 78 of the total number of errors (84.78%) and followed by fragment errors with 14 of the total number of errors (15.22%). These types of grammatical errors can be summarized in the following table:

Table 1. The Frequency and Percentage of Types of Errors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of Grammatical Errors</th>
<th>Global Errors</th>
<th>Local Errors</th>
<th>Other Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Freq.</td>
<td>766</td>
<td>1435</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>33.41</td>
<td>62.58</td>
<td>4.01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 shows that local errors are the most frequent errors made by the students. Based on the data, it was found that most students used incorrect word choice due to negative transfer from their mother tongue. Consequently, the meaning of the sentence in the target language is different from the source language (see example 1).

Example (1): Running dictation is able to subtract stress and boredom of students...

Source language: Running dictation dapat mengurangi stres dan kebosanan siswa...

Correction: Running dictation can reduce the stress and boredom of the students...

Example (2): Learning be meaningful for the students when removal the judgment based on their needs.

Source language: Pembelajaran menjadi bermakna bagi anak-anak ketika pengambilan keputusan berkaitan dengan kebutuhan mereka.
Correction: Learning process will be valuable for children when taking decision based on their needs.

In English, some words are often used together in a way that sounds correct or called as collocation. Unfortunately, this rule cannot be found in Indonesian. Some students tend to translate word-by-word based on what they found in Indonesian-English dictionary without considering whether it is appropriate or not. In example 1, the student translated ‘mengurangi’ into ‘subtract’ instead of ‘relieve’ or ‘reduce’. In Indonesian-English dictionary, “subtract” means ‘mengurangi’, but it is used for calculation. Thus, the appropriate word should be ‘realieve or reduce’ as the collocation of stress.

In example 2, the student incorrectly translated the phrase ‘pengambilan keputusan’ into ‘removing judgment.’ The meaning of this word is acceptable when it is translated into Indonesian. However, ‘removing judgment’ is not appropriate in English. This error happened as the result of literal translation. In this sentence, the correct phrase should be ‘taking decision’ which means ‘pengambilan keputusan’ instead of ‘removal judgment’.

Then, the second type of errors occurred in students’ translation was global errors. Most students had difficulty in using the correct form. This errors can be seen as follows:

Example (3): Elementary school is the best place to start teach and learn about English language.

Source language: Sekolah Dasar adalah tempat terbaik untuk memulai mengajar dan belajar bahasa Inggris.

Correction: Primary school is the best place to start teaching and learning English.

Example (4): Develop material that really fit the way students learn is a very difficult task for teachers.

Source language: Mengembangkan materi yang benar-benar sesuai dengan cara belajar siswa merupakan tugas yang sangat sulit bagi guru.

Correction: Developing materials that actually correspond to student’s learning is a very difficult task for teachers.

In example (3), the student used the base form of ‘teach’ and ‘learn’ instead of gerund since their function as an object in the sentence. This sentence was incorrect because an infinitive ‘to start’ should be followed by gerund. Therefore, the appropriate verb form for this translation should be ‘to start teaching and learning’. Then, example (4) was also incorrect because the students used the base form of ‘develop’ instead of infinitive or gerund even though the position of verb as a subject. In grammatical rule, the verb should be in an infinitive or a gerund when it functions as a subject or object. Hence, the correct form was ‘developing’ or ‘to develop’. Clearly, it shows that the students have limited knowledge about how to use the correct verb formation in the sentence. The students repeatedly made errors in the use of verb formation in their translation that would cause the sentence was grammatically wrong.

The third type of errors made by the students was local errors. Most of the students’ translation were difficult to understand since the message was unclear. The examples are:

Example (5): Develop material that proper with manner students learning constitute assignment that very difficult for teacher.
Developing materials that actually correspond to student’s learning is a very difficult task for teachers.

Example (6): Learning language in base level more effective do because children in a golden age when they get nature mother language.

Correction: Learning a language at a basic level is effectively done because children are in a golden age when they acquire a native language naturally.

As seen in these examples, the students still encountered some problems in composing a correct sentence. The sentences were ungrammatically incorrect and the messages were unclear. It might be the result of word-for-word translation done by the students. They tended to transfer L1 structure into target language that will cause grammatical errors. This findings dealt with with Shan-ling and Yan (2013) who found that the students errors happened due to the negative transfer of mother tongue.

Errors can be caused by many factors. Regarding to this research, two sources of errors influence the students’ translation results. The intralingual error was the major source of errors with 1737 of the total number of errors (76.65%) and followed by interlingual error with 529 of the total number of errors (23.35%). In their translation, some of the students tend to made errors in ordering the words. They ordered the word based on Indonesian pattern rather than the target language pattern. Thus, the sentence will be unstructured and ungrammatical. Dealing with this findings, Wicaksono (2014) also found that the students’ errors were influenced much by the grammatical structure of native language (Indonesian) in making sentences.

However, most of the students made errors that caused by making false concept hypothesized and ignoring the rule of the target language. They tended to generalize the structure of the target language and sometimes making their own structure due to their limited knowledge of the target language itself. This findings was also pinpointed in Arjati (2007) and Sabzalipour (2012). They found that the major source of errors was intralingual errors with false concept hypothesized as one of the main source of errors. The excerpt of students’ errors can be seen in the following table:
Table 2. The Examples of Students’ Errors in Students’ Indonesian-English Translation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Classification</th>
<th>Example of the Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Interlingual errors</td>
<td>Cameron (2001:78) explains that there are four indicators that have effect largest to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Order errors</td>
<td>authority in English for students early age.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Agreement and dependence errors</td>
<td>Children is always active in environment exploration to getting knowledge and experience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Intralingual errors</td>
<td>Running dictation may to minimize students’ stress and students’ bored to finish their assignment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Over-generalization</td>
<td>The childrens always active to explore environment, get knowledge and experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>False concepts hypothesized</td>
<td>Children always active about in exploration environment to get knowledge and experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ignorance of rule restrictions</td>
<td>Running dictation can be help students for improve and practice their reading ability...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Incomplete application of rules</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based the explanation above, it can be stated that the students still have problems when doing translation from Indonesian into English. This problem leads them in making such errors that influence the result and quality of their translations. These errors occur because the students have insufficient knowledge of the target language. The students tend to generalize the certain structure to other structure in the target language. It happens because the grammatical structure of Indonesian is different from English.

In summary, most of the students have difficulties in translating the sentences from Indonesian into English. The tendency of the students in translating the sentences literally leads them to make some errors. This research found that translation is a challenging activity for the students since they need to render the intended meaning from the source language (Indonesian) into the target language (English). By conducting this study, it is expected to give beneficial information for the students to make them more aware of their errors. Furthermore, by studying students’ errors, it can provide data from which inferences about the nature of the translation process and try to provide an appropriate solution in reducing the errors.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of data analysis and the research findings, it can be concluded that:

**first**, there were three types of grammatical errors made by the second year English department students at UIN Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau Pekanbaru, they were global errors, local errors, and other errors. The most frequent error made by the students in their translation was local errors with incorrect word choice has the highest error occurrences and incorrect subject-verb agreement has the fewest errors made by the students. The second type of errors that occur in students’ translation were global errors with incorrect verb formation as the most frequent errors made by the students and incorrect use of modal and incorrect use of connector as the fewest errors. Other errors were the fewest types of errors that arise in students’ translation with unclear error as the most frequent errors made by the students while the fewest error was fragment error.

**Second**, there were two sources of errors that commonly occurred in students’ translation, they were interlingual and intralingual errors. The students frequently made an intralingual error which can be seen from the contribution of this source in their translation with false concept hypothesized and ignorance of rule restriction have a big influence on students’ errors in translation. The second source of errors that caused the errors in students’ translation was the interlingual error. The students tended to transfer their native language structure into target language structure. It can be seen from the sentences in the translation did not show agreement in number between a subject and a verb or a subject and a noun. As a result, the students made such errors in ordering, agreement and dependence.
REFERENCES


